**--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------**

**TRIGGER WARNING: COVID-19, STRUCTURAL VIOLENCE,** **MENTAL HEALTH CRISISES SUCH AS DEPRESSION, SUICIDE, AND DOMESTIC VIOLENCE**

**--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------**

**DEFINITIONS:**

**Essential Workers - Knäbe, Timo. & Carrión-Crespo, Carlos R., 2019. "The scope of essential services laws, regulations**

**and practices," ILO Working Papers 995064193402676, International Labour Organization.**

**“essential services are only those the interruption of which would endanger the life, personal safety or health of whole or part of the population.”**

**Today I must negate Resolved: A just government ought to recognize an unconditional right of workers to strike.**

**We will read 3 offcase positions and then respond to the affirmative**

**FRAMING**

**My value for this round will be morality.**

**Gert**, **88** "Morality: A New Justification of Moral Rules" Bernard Oxford University Press p.6] **Morality is a public system applying to all rational persons, governing behavior which affects others and which has the minimization of evil at its end**, and which includes what are commonly known as the moral rules at its core. If a public system applying to all rational persons does not have this content, then even if it is justified it would not count as a justification of morality. It is only justifying a public system that has the moral rules as its core that counts as a justification of morality. Although there is not complete agreement concerning what counts as a moral rule, almost no one denies that "don't kill," "don't steal," and "don't lie" are moral rules. [Gert, Bernard. 1988. "Morality: A New Justification of Moral Rules" Bernard Oxford University Press p.48 Definition of an Evil]“Everyone agrees that death and pain are evils. In the previous chapter, I pointed out that the desires for pain and death are irrational desires. Since desires for death and pain are irrational desires and since death and pain are evils, it is plausible that **this definition of evil provides us with a list of evils: death, pain,**[and **the**] **loss of freedom, and loss of pleasure.** All of these things is a close relationship between the objects of irrational desires and evils... are generally regarded as evils. **No rational person is indifferent to evils either; in fact, all rational persons avoid evils for themselves.** That there are circumstances in which rational people do not avoid [evils] death, pain, or disability, and may even seek them, does not count at all against the view that these things are an undesirable or evil.” EC/SB.

**My value criterion will be maximizing happiness in consistency with utilitarianism.**

**Mills** explains the utility principle - **actions are right in proportion as they tend to promote happiness, wrong as they tend to produce the reverse of happiness.**

**ESSENTIAL WORKERS DA**

**Uniqueness - Essential workers have gone on a quitting spree, meaning that our workforce is already in a fragile place. (Bolton, 21)** Feclicia Bolton, NewsNation national correspondent and NewsNation Now digital anchor, Frontline workers leaving jobs as a result of pandemic burnout, 05/15/21,

https://www.newsnationnow.com/us-news/frontline-workers-leaving-jobs-as-a-result-of-pandemic-burnout/ **“Many teachers** in the United States say they’re **quitting after the pandemic**, simply because they feel unappreciated, unsafe, and burned out. New data reveals they are not alone; **other frontline workers are following suit.** But researchers at the University of California, Berkeley say there are ways to keep these essential workers on the job. Bill Mathis taught ninth-grade English for several years until quitting last fall. “I think I had been debating quitting about a year before, but Covid really just put the nail in it for me,” said Mathis. He switched from teaching students to working in Michigan’s newly-legalized cannabis industry. He says he quit because he was worried that he’d get COVID-19 and transmit it to his parents or his girlfriend, who has lupus. “Covid is not the beginning of anything. It is just the harshening of every way that these doctors, nurses, teachers, social workers have been treated,” said Mathis. **In 2018, one in five Americans surveyed said they were burnt out at their jobs. About half of public servants — including teachers, firefighters, police, government and social workers — said the same.** Researchers at the University of California, Berkeley say anxiety and burnout have gotten even worse since the pandemic began. This is the biggest contagion spot for COVID in airports “Now, **all** our **recent studies on** health workers and other **front line workers suggest that burnout is increasing**, anxiety is increasing, and so we **expect** that the **rates** are going **to** kind of **stay high for public servants** for a while,” said Elizabeth Linos, a behavioral scientist at University of California, Berkeley.” EC

**Link - Essential workers from certain sectors are already striking, even with conditions that mean future consequences. (EPI, 20)** Economic Policy Institute, Workers are striking during the coronavirus, 06/22/20,

https://www.epi.org/blog/thousands-of-workers-have-gone-on-strike-during-the-coronavirus-labor-law-must-be-reformed-to-strengthe n-this-fundamental-right/ “However, it is evident **essential workers are going on strike** as seen in the **recent walkouts organized by Amazon, Instacart, and Target workers as well as the dozens of strikes organized by fast food and delivery workers.”** EC.

**If the affirmative idea of unconditional right to strike is recognized, there is no doubt that essential workers will leave the workplace to strike**

**France’s essential services are suffering with lack of limitations.**

**Braun 05** "The Right To Strike In Essential Services: Economic Implications". Assembly.Coe.Int, 2021,

https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/X2H-Xref-ViewHTML.asp?FileID=10894&lang=EN. Accessed 30 June 2021.

**Almost all types of strike are allowed in France. Their length is not limited.**

Notice of strike action is five days. Public servants have the right to strike, but not servicemen, police officers, judges or nuclear power station workers. There are also restrictions with regard to air traffic controllers, broadcasting and health service workers. The consequences include suspension of the employment contract and therefore loss of salary, but in many public services strike pay deals have been negotiated ex post facto, something which considerably reduces the adverse consequences for strikers. 38. The proportion of days lost in the public services, or simply the number of public-services strikes in France, is the main reason why the country is seen by the outside world, and perhaps also by the French themselves, as permanently on strike. Another factor is that the statistics lump together the nationalised enterprises – which often spearhead workers’ demands – and the private sector. Compared with its two main partners, Germany and the United Kingdom, **strikes are**particularly **frequent**

**in France, especially in essential services**. In **1997, 42% of working days lost were lost in market-sector public enterprises** – the SNCF **(French Rail)**, the RATP **(Paris transport)**, EDF (the **electricity company**), the**Post Office**and**Air France**. The SNCF and the Post Office came first and second in the table of strike-affected enterprises.

**Non-essential workers will soon follow the trend.**

**Knäbe**, Timo. & Carrión-**Crespo,** Carlos R., **2019.** "The scope of essential services laws, regulations and practices," ILO Working Papers 995064193402676, International Labour Organization.

What is meant by essential services in the strict sense of the term depends to a large extent on the particular circumstances prevailing in a country. Moreover,**this concept is not absolute, in the sense that a non-essential service may become essential if a strike lasts beyond a certain time or extends beyond a certain scope, thus endangering the life, personal safety or health of the whole or part of the population**.2 The CFA has held that in order to determine situations in which a strike could be prohibited, the criterion which has to be met is the existence of a clear and imminent threat to the life, personal safety or health of the whole or part of the population.3

**Internal Link - Unconditional right to strike will allow more essential workers to do so.**

**Last year we saw a few groups of essential workers going on strike. “In Chicago, fast food workers marched to a local McDonald's** where multiple workers had tested positive for the virus. **Fast food workers in Florida walked off the job.** In Durham, N.C., crowds observed a moment of silence before breaking into chants calling for $15 an hour. They also

painted "Strike For Black Lives" in block letters on the street. **In Detroit, workers at five nursing homes participated in a walkout** to protest low wages and poor working conditions, exacerbated by the coronavirus pandemic. **And in San Francisco, 1,500 janitors walked off the job.”**

**If these essential workers are already going on strike when there are consequences in place, there is no doubt that an unconditional right to strike will result in many more essential workers doing so.**

**Impacts- Unconditional essential worker strikes result in the decreased safety of the people.**

**Coal Strike of 1902.**

**(TRC, 21)** Theodore Rosevelt Center, dedicated to preserving the legacy of America’s 26th president, Anthracite Coal Strike,

2021, https://www.theodorerooseveltcenter.org/Learn-About-TR/TR-Encyclopedia/Capitalism-and-Labor/Anthracite-Coal-Strike **“The Anthracite Coal Strike** (May-October **1902**) began after mine operators refused to meet with representatives of the United Mine Workers of America. Anthracite—or hard coal—was solid and rich in carbon, ideal for industrial and domestic use. The strike began in eastern Pennsylvania, where almost all anthracite coal was mined at the time, on May 12, 1902, after the railroad companies which owned the mines refused to meet with representatives of the union. Workers’ requests for better wages, a shorter work week, and recognition of their union had also been denied. **Coal prices doubled as production dropped.** As the autumn began and negotiations between the owners and the miners were ineffective, President Theodore Roosevelt feared that **a coal shortage would result in hardship to Americans during the winter.”**

**Boston 1919 Police Strike.**

**(Maynard, 12)** Melissa Maynard, writer for Pew Trust, Public Strikes Explained: Why There Aren't More of Them, 09/25/12, https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2012/09/25/public-strikes-explained-why-there-arent-more-of-the m “This is in large part because of a **massive 1919 police strike** that took place in Boston **after the police commissioner prohibited members of the force from joining unions. “It led to anarchy in Boston,**” says Martin Malin, director of the Institute for Law and the Workplace at the Kent College of Law in Chicago. “**There was a massive crime wave.”** EC

**Empty essential workforce leads to cultural deprivation and more Thompson, Derek. 2015 "A World Without Work". The Atlantic**

**,https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2015/07/world-without-work/395294/. Accessed 30 June 2021.**

For much of the 20th century, Youngstown’s steel mills delivered such great prosperity that the city was a model of the American dream, boasting a median income and a homeownership rate that were among the nation’s highest. But as manufacturing shifted abroad after World War II,

Youngstown steel suffered, and on that gray September afternoon in 1977, Youngstown Sheet and Tube announced the shuttering of its Campbell Works mill. Within five years, the **city lost 50,000 jobs**and **$1.3 billion in manufacturing wages**. The **effect was so severe that a term was coined**to describe the fallout:**regional depression. Youngstown** was **transformed** not only **by** an **economic disruption**but also by a **psychological and cultural breakdown. Depression, spousal abuse,** and **suicide** all**became** much **more prevalent**; the **caseload of the area’s mental-health center tripled within a decade.** The **city built four prisons in**the **mid-1990s—a rare growth industry.** One of the few downtown construction projects of that period was a museum dedicated to the defunct steel industry. Derek Thompson talks with editor in chief James Bennet about the state of jobs in America. **“Youngstown’s story** is America’s story, because it**shows that when jobs go away, the cultural cohesion of a place is destroyed,**” says John Russo, a professor of labor studies at Youngstown State University. **“The cultural breakdown matters even more than the economic breakdown.”**

**That means no food, more crime, more sickness, no energy, terrible mental health effects and so much more. This leads to destruction and death, resulting in economic and cultural breakdown, and ultimately the most harm done for the most people. This is the affirmative world. We provide the better negative world through our counterplan;**

**COUNTERPLAN - ESSENTIALS**

**CP TEXT**

**Just governments ought to recognize the unconditional right of workers to strike, except for essential workers who shall work a minimum number of hours based on their occupation.**

**By putting a condition on unconditional striking, minimum service requirements allow essential workers to exercise their right to strike and maintain a healthy society. Knäbe, Timo. & Carrión-Crespo, Carlos R., 2019. "The scope of essential services laws, regulations and practices," ILO Working Papers**

**995064193402676, International Labour Organization.**

Frequently, the CEACR recalled under Convention No. 87 that **restrictions on strike action can only be justified in respect of essential services**, public servants exercising authority in the name of the State and in cases of acute national crisis. It further recalled that **essential services are only those the interruption of which would endanger the life, personal safety or health of whole or part of the population.** In an observation regarding **Turkey,** the CEACR noted that sections 29 and 30 of Act No. 2822 **prohibit strike action in activities and services, including property saving, funeral and mortuary, exploration, production and refining of gas and petroleum, banking and public notaries, sanitation, educational and training or day nursery and old**‑**age retirement homes, and cemeteries.** In this respect, the **CEACR stated that, in order to avoid damages which are irreversible or out of all proportion to the occupational interests of the parties to the dispute, as well as damages to third parties, the authorities could establish a system of negotiated minimum service in other services which are of public utility** rather than impose an outright ban on strikes, which would be limited to essential

services in the strict sense of the term.94 The starting point for the definition of minimum service is the de facto denial of the right to strike. One the one hand, the requirement to provide minimum services could be seen as a limitation of the right to strike, since the employees appointed to perform them cannot join strikes, and the effective fulfilment of the services reduces the strike’s effect. On the other hand, **the requirement to ensure minimum services could be seen as an enabler to exercise the right the strike in essential services**. The **CFA** shares this view, **stating** that a **minimum service could be appropriate as a** possible **alternative** in situations in which a substantial restriction or total prohibition of strike action would not appear to be justified and where, **without calling into question the right to strike of the large majority of workers, one might consider ensuring that users’ basic needs are met or that facilities operate safely or without interruption.9**5 [PAGE 39] SB.

**SOLVENCY**

**When only a small part of essential workers strike, we see that there is only an impact big enough to affect the company but minor enough to not really affect the people.**

**(Reuters, 20)** Reuters Staff, international news organisation, EDF workers strike in France, but limited impact on power production, 10/09/20,

https://www.reuters.com/article/us-edf-restructuring/edf-workers-strike-in-france-but-limited-impact-on-power-production-idUSKBN28 J36B “Around **a quarter of workers at** French **power group EDF were on strike** on Thursday over a planned reform of the company **but there was no major impact on power output**, according to EDF and France’s grid operator. A previous strike over the same issue, on Nov. 26, had led to a fall in production from EDF’s nuclear power plants. At 1230 p.m. (1130 GMT) **hydro-electric production was at 13,276 megawatts (MW), down**

**slightly from 14,460 MW** at the same time on Wednesday, data from grid operator RTE showed. Nuclear power production was 45,555 MW versus 46,736 MW a day earlier.”

**This means that all workers, including essential workers, will still have their right to strike recognized by just government, but there will be limitations on how much and how many essential workers can strike, preventing negative impacts including economic and cultural breakdown while not disturbing the positive impacts including self-determination brought forward by the affirmative.**